

Julius Stockhausen's Early Performances of Franz Schubert's *Die schöne Müllerin*

NATASHA LOGES

Franz Schubert's huge song cycle *Die schöne Müllerin*, D. 795, is a staple of recital halls and record collections, currently available in no fewer than 125 recordings as an uninterrupted sequence of twenty songs.¹ In the liner notes of one recent release, the tenor Robert Murray observes that the hour-long work requires considerable stamina in comparison with operatic roles.² Although Murray does not comment on the demands the work makes on its audience, this is surely also a consideration, and certainly one that shaped the early performance history of the work. This article offers a detailed consideration of the pioneering complete perfor-

mances of *Die schöne Müllerin* by the baritone Julius Stockhausen (1826–1906), as well as the responses of his audiences, collaborators, and critics.³ The circumstances surrounding the first complete performance in Vienna's Musikverein on 4 May 1856, more than three decades after the cycle was composed in 1823, will be traced.⁴ Subsequent performances by Stockhausen will

This study was generously funded by the British Academy in 2015–16.

¹See <http://www.prestoclassical.co.uk/>, accessed 11 November 2016.

²Liner notes, Robert Murray and Andrew West, Schubert *Die schöne Müllerin*, Stone Records Catalogue No: 5060192780628, 7.

³For an account of early Schubert song performance in a variety of public and private contexts, see Eric Van Tassel, "'Something Utterly New': Listening to Schubert Lieder. 1: Vogl and the Declamatory Style," *Early Music* 25/4 (November 1997): 702–14. A general history of the Lied in concert focusing on the late nineteenth century is in Edward F. Kravitt, "The Lied in 19th-Century Concert Life," *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 18 (1965): 207–18.

⁴This study focuses on the unique demands of *Die schöne Müllerin*. Evidence suggests that different approaches were taken to different groups of songs, including Schubert's *Winterreise*, D. 911, and *Schwanengesang*, D. 957, Robert Schumann's *Dichterliebe*, op. 48, *Myrthen*, op. 25, and the Spanish cycles for vocal ensembles op. 74 and op. 138.

then be surveyed; these reveal that a performance of the “complete cycle” meant many different things in his day. Stockhausen’s artistic idealism jostled against the practical forces that necessarily influenced his approach to recital programming, leading to a multifaceted, untidy performance history for this cycle; within Stockhausen’s concert career at least, it was no foregone conclusion that the complete cycle should always be performed.⁵ The same applies to other song cycles such as Schubert’s *Winterreise*, D. 911, or Schumann’s *Dichterliebe*, op. 48; each group of songs inspired different practices because of their varying demands on performers and audiences.⁶

An outstanding interpreter and teacher, Stockhausen was centrally important to German song, transforming it into a concert-worthy genre, laying the foundations for a song canon, and through his considerable teaching practice, training the next generation to develop this legacy.⁷ This consideration of his recital practices is based primarily on an ex-

amination of the collection of concert programs preserved in the Stockhausen-Nachlass in the University Library of Frankfurt (D-Fmi), cross-referenced with other sources such as the unpublished archive of concert programs held at the Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde in Vienna (A-Wgm) and Stockhausen’s unpublished diaries. Stockhausen doubtless gave more concerts than those documented in Frankfurt, however the number of verifiable accounts, and their temporal proximity, suggests that the record is largely complete.⁸ Where possible, printed programs have been cross-checked against other documents such as letters and diaries, as these were not necessarily accurate, especially when a concert was organized at the last minute. In particular, small-scale repertoire like the Lied might be altered on the day of the concert, and additional numbers might be included spontaneously as encores.

Furthermore, comparisons with diary accounts and correspondence help evoke the lived career that will be familiar to any musician (with delayed trains, poor weather, colds, dreary hotels, loneliness, haggling over concert fees, and the delicate balance between friendship and professional collegiality). Some important questions are only partially answered by surviving documents. For instance, it seems that only some choral items normally merited printed texts; in solo song, the audience generally had to rely on a singer’s diction. Accompanists are often unnamed, an indication of their place within the hierarchy of information printed on a concert leaflet. Also, it is likely, given the encore tradition, that the audience applauded after each song, and this might therefore be encored on the spot (indeed, some reviews specifically mention this), resulting in an experience for both performers and audience that is vastly different from today’s, even if such performances were billed as complete cycles.

⁵Brahms’s own concert career has been documented in Renate and Kurt Hofmann, *Johannes Brahms als Pianist und Dirigent: Chronologie seines Wirkens als Interpret*, ed. Otto Biba (Tutzing: Hans Schneider, 2006). For an unusual methodological approach to Clara Schumann’s concert career, see Reinhard Kopiez, Andreas C. Lehmann, and Janina Klassen, “Clara Schumann’s Collection of Playbills: A Historiometric Analysis of Life-span Development, Mobility, and Repertoire Canonization,” *Poetics* 37/1 (2009): 50–73.

⁶I am currently exploring historic performances of *Dichterliebe*, particularly Clara Schumann’s practice of interpolating solo piano works. See Natasha Loges, “From Miscellanies to Musical Works: Julius Stockhausen, Clara Schumann and *Dichterliebe*,” currently in preparation. There is a partial overlap between this topic and the wider aesthetic implications of the recital, which has been widely studied within Anglo-German scholarship. For one example, see Rohan H. Stewart-MacDonald, “The Recital in England: Sir William Sterndale Bennett’s ‘Classical Chamber Concerts,’ 1843–1856,” *Ad Parnassum* 13/25 (2015): 115–75.

⁷I have also explored Stockhausen’s practices with respect to Brahms’s op. 33 in “The Limits of the Lied,” *Brahms in the Home and the Concert Hall: Between Private and Public Performance*, ed. Katy Hamilton and Natasha Loges (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2014), 300–23. An invaluable source is the correspondence between Stockhausen and Brahms, Johannes Brahms, *Johannes Brahms Briefwechsel* vol. 18: *Johannes Brahms im Briefwechsel mit Julius Stockhausen* (Tutzing: Hans Schneider, 1993). See also Renate Hofmann, “Julius Stockhausen als Interpret der Liederzyklen Robert Schumanns,” *Schumann-Forschungen* 9 (2005): 34–46.

⁸The study assumes the simplest possible definition of a concert, namely a public, ticketed event. It thus excludes events in private homes and the court appearances Stockhausen made in cities like Hanover and Stuttgart, in which programming would be shaped by the tastes of an individual patron and is in any event often poorly documented.

In the early years of Stockhausen's performing career, the patterned miscellany concert format still dominated concert halls.⁹ This consisted of a controlled alternation of artists and genres, in long programs that might include single or paired movements of longer works, improvisations, bravura works, and isolated arias from operas or oratorios. The move away from such concerts to the programming of a small number of complete works was mainly associated with a number of artists, concert venues, and cities in the second half of the nineteenth century.¹⁰ Those artistic ideals and—to some extent—concert practices endure in concert halls today. When it came to solo, chamber, and song repertoire, chief among these figures were the members of Johannes Brahms's social and artistic circle, principally Clara Schumann, Joseph Joachim, and Stockhausen.¹¹ Since their deaths, their performance legacies have been somewhat simplified; what has endured is the recollection that they were regarded as "servants" or "priests" who placed the artwork uppermost and promulgated the

idea of carefully conceived concert programs.¹² Certainly, this is true to some extent, but in practice, many of their concerts still reflected long-established frameworks, principally the idea of a patterned miscellany. Whether the concert was billed as part of a subscription series, a special event, a "soirée," "matinée musicale," "Novitäten-Soirée," "Historisches Concert," a student showcase, a "Künstler-Concert," or even a "Quartett-Produktion," it usually involved a mixture of genres.¹³ For this reason, the change of approach toward large cycles like *Die schöne Müllerin* was gradual and not necessarily cumulative; it merits closer scrutiny because these formats afforded the flexibility for continually fresh approaches to the repertoire.

Nevertheless, within this environment, there were several reasons why *Die schöne Müllerin* was the right work, and Vienna the right city, for Stockhausen to make his mark as a distinctive, daring, and intelligent artist in the 1850s. Especially in Vienna, interest in Schubert's music had been growing steadily from the 1830s onwards, punctuated by significant premieres of instrumental and choral works, in tandem with a wider tendency toward establishing an Austro-German musical hegemony.¹⁴ The 1850s

⁹For a broader consideration, see especially William Weber, *The Great Transformation of Musical Taste: Concert Programming from Haydn to Brahms* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2008).

¹⁰It is beyond the scope of this study to trace the full evolution of this practice, which is linked to wider aesthetic, socioeconomic, political, and gender issues. It gradually coalesced during the second half of the century, borne by many singers and pianists working across a vast geographical region. The embedding of the practice of singing full song cycles seems to have become more common in the 1880s, although there were many exceptions well into the following century. Studies of singers shed some light on individual contributions. See, for example, George S. Bozarth, *Johannes Brahms & George Henschel: An Enduring Friendship* (Sterling Heights: Harmonie Park, 2008); Gabriele Gaiser-Reich, *Gustav Walter 1834–1910: Wiener Hofopernsänger und Liederfürst* (Tutzing: Hans Schneider, 2011); and especially Beatrix Borchard, *Stimme und Geige: Amalie und Joseph Joachim: Biographie und Interpretationsgeschichte* (Vienna: Böhlau, 2007).

¹¹There is no recent biography of Stockhausen, although Sarah Hodgson is currently writing a dissertation on him, drawing on his collection of scores. See the biography by his daughter, Julia Wirth, *Julius Stockhausen, der Sänger des deutschen Liedes: nach Dokumenten seiner Zeit dargestellt* (Frankfurt: Englert & Schlosser, 1927).

¹²The words "priest" and "priestess" were used regularly with reference to Joachim and Clara Schumann in particular. See, for instance, Nancy B. Reich, *Clara Schumann: The Artist and The Woman* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2001), 255ff. For more detailed considerations of Joachim's and Clara Schumann's practices, see Beatrix Borchard, "Joseph Joachim: Vom Wunderkind zum Hohenpriester der deutschen Musik—Ein kulturhistorischer Weg," *Berliner Beiträge zur Musikwissenschaft* 10/2 (1995): 26–39. See also Beatrix Borchard, "Botschafter der reinen Kunst: Vom Virtuosen zum Interpreten: Joseph Joachim und Clara Schumann," *Basler Jahrbuch für historische Musikpraxis* 20 (1996): 95–113.

¹³String quartet concerts were most generically "pure," judging from Musikverein programs, but would still usually involve trios and duos. Choral concerts often included a solo item.

¹⁴For a broader consideration of nationalistic elements in Schubert reception, see Christopher H. Gibbs, "German Reception: Schubert's 'Journey to Immortality,'" in *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, ed. Gibbs (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), 239–53; an early review acclaimed Schubert's *Winterreise* as "the nature of German Romantic being and art" and praised Schubert as a "German composer through and through." *Ibid.*, 243. On the topic of German symphonic repertoire, see, for example, Sanna Pederson, "A. B. Marx, Berlin Concert Life, and German National Identity," this journal 18 (1994): 87–

saw Schubert's music presented in many ways, including arrangements, improvisations and semi-dramatizations. For example, as part of a concert on 8 November 1859 at the large Redouten-Saal for the Schiller-Fond, Schubert's song "Gruppe aus dem Tartarus," D. 583, was performed in an orchestration by the opera Kapellmeister Herr Esser;¹⁵ choral arrangements of particularly beloved songs like "Litanei auf das Fest Aller Seelen," D. 343, also proliferated. On 13 February 1862, "Der Müller und der Bach" and a Mendelssohn work were performed in an arrangement for harmonium.¹⁶ On 26 November 1862, 7 pm, a soirée at Carl Haslinger's billed as an "Erinnerungsfeier an Franz Schubert" included not only works by Schubert but also "Der Gang nach Hernalz: Episode aus Schubert's Leben," an extremely lengthy narrative poem by L. Scheyrer; and "Freie Fantasie auf dem Pianoforte nach Schubert'schen Motiven"; at the bottom of the program it was stated: "The audience is politely requested to bring themes by Schubert for free improvisation."¹⁷ All this suggests a sense of discovery, and a desire to embrace Schubert (both the man and the music) in public musical life by appropriating and adapting the material he supplied in a variety of concert practices.

When it came to song, individual Schubert numbers often featured within mixed concerts. Indeed, a range of artists with different affiliations (Liszt, Rubinstein, Hans von Bülow, Clara Schumann, Brahms) and singers like Jenny Lind, Therese Tietjens, Luise Dustmann, Ida Flatz, Caroline Bettelheim, Gustav Walter, and others included Schubert's keyboard and vocal works in their programs. One noteworthy concert was held in Vienna on 19 November 1850, an "Erinnerungs-Feier an Franz Schubert," in which the number of vocal items (mainly cho-

ral) outnumbered the instrumental items.¹⁸ Another "Schubert-Feier" followed on 28 February 1851 in the same city. Yet another "Schubert-Feier" on 25 November 1853 included a mixture of songs, solo piano, and chamber works, and on this occasion, the pianist was Benedict Randhartinger, who would accompany Stockhausen's first complete *Müllerin* a few years later.¹⁹ An "Abend-Unterhaltung" or evening entertainment at the Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde on 26 February 1856—just two months before the complete *Müllerin*—was dedicated entirely to Schubert and included various songs that I have identified elsewhere as frequently heard in private settings.²⁰

Stockhausen himself sang individual songs from *Die schöne Müllerin* for many years before he performed the complete cycle. His earliest identified performance of one of the songs was in Zurich in winter 1849 for the Allgemeine Musikgesellschaft, when he sang No. 7 "Ungeduld."²¹ This ebullient song was (and remains) a crowd-pleaser, showing off the voice with its increasingly fervent iterations of the words "Dein ist mein Herz" (that said, it is not possible to determine which key Stockhausen sang it in). He sang the same song in the Aula-Saal at Mannheim on 28 October 1852 as part of a mixed vocal and instrumental concert, alongside Mendelssohn's perennial favorite "Auf Flügeln des Gesanges," op. 34, no. 2.²²

107, and one response, Celia Applegate, "How German Is It? Nationalism and the Idea of Serious Music in the Early Nineteenth Century," this journal 21 (1998): 274–96.

¹⁵A-Wgm Programmsammlung, 8 November 1859, Großer Redouten-Saal.

¹⁶A-Wgm Programmsammlung, "Privat-Abonnements-Soirée," Thursday, 13 February 1862, venue unstated.

¹⁷"Es wird höflichst ersucht, Themas von Schubert zur freien Fantasie mitzubringen." A-Wgm Programmsammlung, 26 November 1862.

¹⁸The program was "Widerspruch" (choir and piano), "Auf dem See," and "Ungeduld" (sung by Herr Lutz), "Ständchen" (choir and piano), "Des Mädchens Klage," and "Der Kreuzzug" sung by Betty Bury, the *Andante mit Variationen* from the String Quartet in D, "Der Gondelfahrer" (choir and piano), "Die Nachtigall" (vocal quartet with piano), and "Nachthelle" (solo, choir, and piano). A-Wgm Programmsammlung, 19 November 1850.

¹⁹A-Wgm Programmsammlung, 25 November 1853, Musikverein.

²⁰The performed songs were grouped into pairs as follows: "Der blinde Knabe" and "Die zürmende Diana"; "Mädchens Klage" and "Der Tod und das Mädchen"; "Gruppe aus dem Tartarus" and "Harfners Gesang"; and finally "Ave Maria" and "Gretchen am Spinnrad" [sic]. A-Wgm Programmsammlung, Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde, 26 February 1856. See Loges, "The Limits of the Lied," 303–05.

²¹Wirth, *Julius Stockhausen*, 123.

²²This is not documented in a printed program but is included in Wirth's typewritten list in D-Fmi Nachlass Julius Stockhausen, Konzert-Zettel.

Although it is not clear when the idea of singing the complete *Müllerin* cycle in Vienna settled in Stockhausen's mind, several steps were taken in 1853–54 to prepare his audience for such a feat. First, Stockhausen drew upon private endorsement to bolster the usual public press announcements of his upcoming concerts in the city. He established contact with Viennese artistic circles, including the Burgtheater actress Amalie Haizinger, who recalled that, upon hearing him sing: "We were all fired up, and invited a small group of aficionados straight away who also listened to him and helped make propaganda for his first concert (in those days, advertisements were not yet fashionable) since we were not for a moment worried about the other [concerts]—the experience spoke for itself. There was a complete scrimmage for seats at the six concerts in the then small Musikverein under the Tuchlauben."²³ With an inconsistency typical of such sources, Haizinger mentions six concerts while the press mentions five; in any case, it was a substantial number of concerts within a single tour in one city.²⁴

Stockhausen was the billed sponsor of the first concert on 26 February 1854, but shared it with the celebrity violinist Henri Vieuxtemps.²⁵

²³"Wir waren ganz aufgepulvert, luden gleich eine kleine Gemeinde von Sachverständigen ein, die ihn auch hören und helfen mußten (damals waren die Reklamen noch nicht Mode), Propaganda für sein erstes Konzert zu machen, denn für die Folgenden war uns nicht einen Moment bange, die Erfahrung sprach für uns. In sechs Konzerten hat man sich um die Sitze im damaligen kleinen Musikverein unter den Tuchlauben völlig gebalgt." Luise Schönfeld-Neumann and Helene Bettelheim-Gabillon, *Amalie Haizinger: Gräfin Louise Schönfeld-Neumann: biographische Blätter* (Vienna: Carl Konegen, 1906), 169.

²⁴See "Notizen," *Neue Wiener Musik-Zeitung*, 30 March 1854, 4.

²⁵"Einige Sensation erregt gegenwärtig ein Herr Stockhausen, ein geborener Strassburger und Schüler Garcia's. In Vieuxtemp's letztem Concerte lernte ihn das Publicum durch den Vortrage einiger Mendelssohn'schen Lieder kennen und zeichnete ihn durch so lebhaften Beifall aus, dass er sich zu einem Cyklus eigener Concerte veranlasst fand, deren erstes eben heute Statt hatte." *Niederrheinische Musik-Zeitung für Kunstfreunde und Künstler* 2/10, 11 March 1854, "Wiener Briefe," 76. See A-Wgm Programmsammlung, Sunday, 26 February 1854, 12.30 pm Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde, shared with Marie Cruvelli and Henri Vieuxtemps.

The mixed program included a Mozart overture, Italian and French operatic arias (the singer Marie Cruvelli also took part), and the two *Müllerin* numbers "Der Müller und der Bach" and "Wohin." This was followed by two numbers by Vieuxtemps and more arias. The reviews of this and subsequent concerts are worth quoting at length, since the same principles emerged repeatedly.

[Stockhausen] possesses a fine-sounding, if somewhat dry baritone voice, excellent cultivation, and in song performance is in any case the most outstanding singer we have heard for a long time in the concert hall. This time he sang two of Schubert's Müllerlieder ("Der Müller an den Bach" and "Wohin?"), then arias. . . . He admittedly brings all technical perfection and artistic cultivation to the dramatic aspect, but lacks the necessary strength of organ, hence he succeeds best in song. Honoured concert-singers, male and female, may take note at this point that Schubert too, among other song composers, offers very "grateful" undertakings—and not just *Erlkönig*—which need only be approached with insight and sensitivity in order to ensure a stirring effect.²⁶

Stockhausen's repertoire choices were evidently received with approval and respect, and crucially, the idea of artistic cultivation was associated with him. Furthermore, his success was associated with the "discovery" of Schubert's astonishing creative breadth.

²⁶"Er besitzt eine wohlthönende, wenn auch etwas trockene Baritonstimme, eine vortreffliche Bildung und ist jedenfalls im Liederfache der ausgezeichnetste Sänger, welchen wir seit Langem im Concertsaale gehört. Er sang dieses Mal zwei von den Schubert'schen Müllerlieder ('Der Müller an den Bach' und 'Wohin?'), dann Arien aus der diebischen Elster, aus dem Johann von Paris und mit Fräul. Marie Cruvelli, eine Schwester der berühmten Sophie Cruvelli, ein Duett aus Semiramis. Für den dramatischen Vortrag nun bringt er zwar alle technische Fertigkeit und Kunstbildung mit, aber nicht die nöthige Kraft des Organs, daher er denn seine schönsten Erfolge im Liede gewinnt. Die geehrten Concert-Sänger und Sängerinnen mögen es sich bei dieser Gelegenheit ad notam nehmen, dass auch Schubert—and nicht bloss im Erlkönig—nebst einigen anderen Lieder-Componisten sehr 'dankbare' Aufgaben stellen, die nur mit Einsicht und Empfindung gelöst zu werden brauchen, um ihrer zündenden Wirkung gewiss zu sein." *Niederrheinische Musik-Zeitung für Kunstfreunde und Künstler* 2/10, 11 March 1854, "Wiener Briefe," 76.

Two weeks later the same paper reinforced the same ideas still more strongly:

A most interesting concert—his third—was given recently to great acclaim by the baritone Julius Stockhausen, who has rapidly grown to great popularity. This also had the side-effect of gathering the kind of profusion of charming females to which one is unaccustomed in halls dedicated to the arts. As I recently wrote, it is not through an especially fine-sounding voice that he achieves his effects so much as the beautiful intimacy of his interpretation, combined with refined cultivation of his limited means. He sang, in addition to an aria from Sacchini's *Oedipus* which would have been better omitted, four Schubert songs: "Die liebe Farbe," "Die böse Farbe," "Am Meere," "Liebesbotschaft," and two of R. Schumann's most beautiful songs: "Mondnacht" and "Frühlingsnacht." He performed the first two Schubert songs and the Schumann songs especially charmingly, the latter of which had such a rousing effect that they both had to be encores. Indeed, it must still be said in Vienna that, with Schubert songs—excepting a half-dozen where it is acknowledged—as well as the majority of Schumann's and Loewe's songs, one may achieve a profound effect in the concert hall, if only one understands how to sing them. The public need not be reminded of this, since their openness is demonstrated at every opportunity, but rather the unprincipled and unpoetic singers. Just recently a singer famous throughout Europe dared to claim to my face that of Schubert's many hundred songs, only a few were suitable for concert performance!²⁷

²⁷"Ein sehr interessantes Concert—sein drittes—gab neulich der schnell zu grosser Beliebtheit emporgestiegene Baritonist Julius Stockhausen, welches auch noch das Nebenverdienst hatte, ein solche Fülle reizender Mädchengestalten zu versammeln, wie man es in den kunstgeweihten Hallen nicht gewohnt ist. Wie ich Ihnen schon neulich schrieb, so ist es keineswegs der Zauber eines besonders wohl lautenden Organs, durch welchen er wirkt, als vielmehr die schöne Innerlichkeit seines Vortrages, verbunden mit trefflicher Bildung der an sich nur geringen Mittel. Er sang ausser einer Arie aus Sacchini's 'Oedip,' die besser weggeblieben wäre, vier Schubert'sche Lieder: Die liebe Farbe, Die böse Farbe, Am Meere, Liebesbotschaft, und zwei der schönsten Lieder von R. Schumann: Mondnacht und Frühlingsnacht. Ueberaus reizend trug er besonders die beiden ersten Schubert'schen und die Schumann'schen Lieder vor, welche letztere eine so zündende Wirkung hervorbrachten, dass sie beide wiederholt werden mussten. Ja, das muss noch in Wien gesagt werden, dass man mit Schubert'schen Liedern—ein halbes Dutzend ausgenommen, von denen man es gelten lässt—, so wie mit der Mehrzahl der Schumann'schen und Löwe'schen Gesänge auch im Concertsaale tiefe Wirkungen

Once again, Stockhausen's artistry and Schubert's unappreciated genius are interwoven, with some tactful flattery of the discerning public, and implicit criticism of most singers' "unpoetic" repertoire choices. At another concert on the same tour on 23 March at the Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde, the pattern was continued: the program consisted of two songs (by Blumenthal and Mendelssohn) sung by Amalie Machalitzki; Stockhausen singing "Der Neugierige" and "Ungeduld" from *Müllerin*; an operatic flute fantasy; a set of three songs "Ueber die Berge" (Mendelssohn), "Widmung" (Schumann) and "An die Leyer [*sic!*]" (Schubert); another operatic flute fantasy; and as the final item Schubert's "Liebesbotschaft" and "Aufenthalt" from *Schwanengesang* (several works were often presented as a single item on a program).²⁸ And so it continued into the next year and different venues. On 9 December 1855, for example, he sang three unspecified numbers from *Müllerin* in Basel in a duet concert he shared with Rosa Kastner.²⁹

The regular inclusion of this repertoire seems to have gradually cemented in his audiences' minds the image of Stockhausen as the intelligent, sensitive conduit of Schubert's inspired Lieder, and this was the basis upon which he could stretch their expectations. Repeating repertoire was fundamentally important; as William Weber has pointed out, the ideology of "serious" listening most probably did not align neatly with actual practices.³⁰ Repetition, albeit in different patterns, rendered repertoire familiar and acceptable on the concert stage, and bridged the gap between amateur performance (exemplified by Moritz von Schwind's

zu erzielen vermag, wenn man sie nur zu singen versteht. Nicht dem Publicum braucht es gesagt zu werden, das seine Empfänglichkeit dafür bei jeder Gelegenheit beweis't, wohl aber den gesinnungs- und poesielosen Sängern. Wagte doch erst neulich ein europa-berühmten Sänger mir ins Gesicht zu behaupten, von den vielen Hundert Liedern Schubert's seien nur einige wenige zum Vortrag im Concertsaale geeignet!" "Wiener Briefe," *Niederrheinische Musik-Zeitung* 2/12 (25 March 1854): 94.

²⁸A-Wgm Programmsammlung, Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde, Thursday, 23 March 1854 8pm. "Viertes Concert des Julius Stockhausen, Sänger aus Paris."

²⁹D-Fmi Nachlass Julius Stockhausen, Konzert-Zettel.

³⁰For a discussion, see William Weber, "Did People Listen in the 18th Century?" *Early Music* 25/4 (November 1997): 678–91.

famous 1868 drawing of a Schubert evening at the home of Joseph von Spaun, in which the listeners and performers are all crowded around the piano) and the more formalized, professional presentation on the recital stage usually reserved for depictions of operatic singers.³¹

Sadly, there is no documentary evidence of Stockhausen's thinking behind the complete *Müllerin* in 1856. It is known that he gave two concerts in Vienna on 27 April and 4 May, and it was in the second of these that he sang the complete *Müllerin* songs at the Musikverein, accompanied by the aforementioned Benedict Randhartinger, the Viennese Vice-Hofkapellmeister, a well-known local figure and a fine song composer in his own right.³² Unfortunately, the program for the 4 May concert no longer exists, but the program from the first concert has survived and is reproduced in plate 1.

The *Monatschrift für Theater und Musik* carried two reports of the concerts. The critic begins by declaring that one can hardly believe there is room for *another* vocal concert when the season is long over, yet Stockhausen put on two—and furthermore, they were full: “You know this exceptional artist; I therefore do not need to explain why his completely masterful *bravour*, his fine, thoroughly prepared and nuanced voice—sounding particularly well in the higher range . . . his noble demeanour, has aroused the sympathy of his listeners and elicited the most untrammelled approval from the public everywhere he has appeared.”³³ Again,

³¹Leon Botstein, among others, has commented on the centrality of listening. “In the end, however, the historical significance of music, or, rather, the significance of music in history, rests not so much with its creators and performers but with amateurs and those who heard and listened.” Leon Botstein, “Toward a History of Listening,” *Musical Quarterly* 82/3 (1998): 431.

³²This significant program is missing not only from the Stockhausen collection in Frankfurt but also from the collection of Musikverein programs held by the Archiv der Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde, Vienna. The concert was reported extensively in the press. See, among others, *Wiener Zeitung*, no. 104, 6 May 1856, 413–14, and the *Fremden-Blatt*, 4 May 1856, 8.

³³“Sie kennen den ausgezeichneten Künstler, ich brauche also nicht auszuführen, warum dessen ganz vortreffliche Bravour, seine feine bis auf kleinste ausgearbeitete und nuancirte Stimme—besonders wohlklingend in den höhern Lagen . . . , —seine noble Manier, überall, wo er auftrat, die Sympathien der Zuhörer erwecken und das Publicum

Stockhausen's subtle and intelligent artistry is praised, and allied with this is the idea of nobility, of transcending mere entertainment despite one of his programs offering a typical mix of genres and numbers, including a Rossini duet, what seems to be an improvised virtuoso violin number (No. 3 Violinpièce, performed by Mr. C. Nossek), and two numbers (most probably light) by the pianist-composer Carl Evers (1819–75).

The second report covered both concerts. The author regretted the absence of Stockhausen's other signature repertoire, namely early-nineteenth-century French opera arias, in favor of the frivolous Rossini for the first concert, but he praised the idea of singing the complete *Müllerin* in the second: “Mr Stockhausen's mastery in Lied performance has been long recognized. The thought of performing the whole cycle of Schubert Müllerlieder in one concert is a very pleasing one. We reluctantly missed in Mr Stockhausen's program the older French repertoire which suits the highly-regarded artist far more than Rossini, and furthermore offers much more of interest.”³⁴ In other words, audiences already associated serious, intellectually demanding or unusual repertoire with Stockhausen and were disappointed when the program did not offer it. Even given the limitations of the miscellany format, the audience had developed clear expectations of repertoire from him despite his being not quite thirty years old.

In a long review, Eduard Hanslick noted with pleasure that Stockhausen had avoided the usual “hotchpotch of pieces,” expressed his surprise at the high attendance, and noted that the evening would appeal to “genuine devotees of German music” (a patriotic strain that is frequently encountered in these reviews); and he

zum rückhaltlosesten Beifall fortreißen muß.” “Leipzig,” *Monatschrift für Theater und Musik* II/5 (May 1856): 262–65.

³⁴“Hrn. Stockhausen's Meisterschaft im Liedervortrage ist längst anerkannt. Der Gedanke, den ganzen Cyclus der Schubert'schen ‘Müllerlieder’ in einem Concerte vorzutragen ist ein sehr glücklicher zu nennen. Ungern vermißten wir im Programm des Hrn. Stockhausen die ältere französische Musik, welche dem geschätzten Künstler weit mehr zusagt als die Rossini'sche und überdies weit mehr Interesse biete als diese.” “Concert-Bericht,” *Monatschrift für Theater und Musik* II/5 (May 1856): 280.

CONCERT

des Julius

Stockhausen,

Sonntag, den 27. April 1856,

Abends halb 8 Uhr,

im SAALE der

GESELLSCHAFT DER MUSIKFREUNDE.

PROGRAMM:

1. **Sonate** für Piano und Violine (D) . C. Evers,
vorgetragen vom **Componisten** und Hrn.
Nossek.
2. **Arie** aus dem Oratorium „Paulus,“ . Mendelssohn,
vorgetragen vom **Concertgeber.**
3. **Violinplèce**, vorgetragen von Herrn C.
Nossek.
4. **Adelaide**, Beethoven,
vorgetragen vom **Concertgeber.**
5. **Duett** aus der Oper „Barbier von Sevilla,“ Rossini,
vorgetragen von Frln. **Kutschera** und
dem **Concertgeber.**
6. a) **Liebesfeier**, (nach Gedichten) für Piano C. Evers,
b) **Cadenz**, von Lenau, }
vorgetragen vom **Componisten.**
7. a) **Frühlingslied**, Mendelssohn,
b) **Frühlingsglaube**, F. Schubert,
c) **Frühlingsnacht**, Schumann,
vorgetragen vom **Concertgeber.**

Obgenannte Mitwirkende haben ihre Leistungen aus besonderer Gefälligkeit für den Concertgeber freundlichst zugesagt.

Cerclesitze zu 3 fl., Parterresitze zu 2 fl., Gallerie-sitze zu 1 fl. 30 kr. und Eintrittskarten zu 1 fl.

sind in den k. k. Hof-, Kunst- und Musikalienhandlungen der Herren C. A. Spina und C. Haslinger, in den Kunst- und Musikalienhandlungen der Herren Mechetti und Levy, so wie am Tage des Concertes an der Kasse zu haben.

Aus J. B. Wallishausser's k. k. Hoftheater-Druckerei:

observed that while individual songs were well known, the performance of the whole cycle enabled a transition from isolated lyric parts (including weaker songs) into a unified and meaningful dramatic whole—a way of thinking about the work that eventually gained total ascendancy. Much of Hanslick's review was also given over to praising Schubert's genius, again reminding his readers that this national treasure was still underappreciated (and thereby tacitly commending Stockhausen for his taste and perspicuity, and his audience for their appreciation of him). This review presents a crucial constellation of ideas and values that includes Stockhausen himself, his audience, Schubert's genius, and national pride, along with notions of cultivation, good taste, wholeness, and coherence.

From a technical standpoint, the review also reveals that Stockhausen reverted to falsetto singing where necessary because of a sore throat, and that he was exhausted at the end.³⁵ Some light is also shed upon contemporary transposition practices by Haizinger's observation below: "[Stockhausen] was the first to sing the whole cycle of Müllerlieder, and you, dear Rosalie, own the volume in which he wrote down his small changes, because some of the songs were too high for his voice."³⁶ This suggests that Stockhausen may have used the original keys, but simply altered high notes as necessary. Despite these technical setbacks, Stockhausen himself was very pleased with the result, all the more so because he had struggled with a dry and painful throat, and the concert was at 12:30 pm, as a letter to his father revealed.

³⁵"Sammelsurium[s] von Stücken . . . echten Anhänger deutscher Musik." The full review is in Eduard Hanslick, *Geschichte des Concertwesens in Wien: Aus dem Concertsaal. Kritiken und Schilderungen aus den letzten 20 Jahren des Wiener Musiklebens*, 2 vols. (Vienna: Braumüller, 1869), 2:100–03.

³⁶"Er war der erste, der den ganzen Zyklus der Müllerlieder sang, und du, liebe Rosalie, besitzest das Heft, in welchem er eigenhändig kleine Änderungen aufzeichnete, weil einige davon zu hoch für seine Stimmlage waren." Helene Bettelheim-Gabillon, *Amalie Haizinger*, 169. The notated alterations of the Schubert singer Michael Vogl have been the subject of much comment. See, for example, Walther Dürr, "Schubert and Johann Michael Vogl: A Reappraisal," this journal 3 (1979): 126–40.

Added to that was the fact that I had programmed the whole of Schubert's *Schöne Müllerin*, twenty songs, and gave the concert practically alone. Nevertheless, the inspiration was still a happy one, since the hall was packed full, and the net income came to 900 Francs. . . . I think I wrote to you that my first concert was empty, and this was due to the beautiful bright weather. Fortunately, the rain soon came, the interesting program absolutely suited the Viennese, and so I was amply rewarded for my efforts!³⁷

This letter puts a rather different complexion on how discerning Stockhausen's audience really was; his implication was that it was the poor weather, rather than a passion for Schubert, that drove them into the concert hall!

LATER PERFORMANCES

The following month, Stockhausen met Johannes Brahms for the first time at the Lower Rhine Music Festival. He immediately invited Brahms to give a concert together, and he wrote excitedly to Ferdinand Hiller of Brahms's acceptance, declaring that even though "his fingers are not in practice at the moment, he has said he would play all the same"—he would complain about Brahms's lack of practice more than once over the years.³⁸ With Brahms, however, Stockhausen returned seamlessly to the idea of a shared miscellaneous "Künstler-Concert" in the Gelber Saal of the Casino in Cologne on 27 May 1856. The program included substantial keyboard works for Brahms: Bach's *Chromatic Fantasy* and Beethoven's C-Minor Variations; Stockhausen sang a French aria, three unidentified numbers from *Die schöne*

³⁷"Dazu kam noch der Umstand, daß ich die ganze 'Schöne Müllerin' von Schubert, zwanzig Lieder, als Programm aufgestellt hatte und beinah allein das Konzert gab. Der Gedanke war dennoch ein glücklicher, denn der Saal war gesteckt voll, und die Einnahme kam netto auf neunhundert Francs. . . . Ich glaube, ich habe Dir geschrieben, daß mein erstes Konzert leer war, und das war dem schönen, hellen Wetter zuzuschreiben. Zum Glück kam bald Regen, das interessante, für die Wiener recht passende Programme, und so wurde ich für die Anstrengung . . . ziemlich belohnt!" Letter of 16 May 1856, Düsseldorf. Wirth, *Julius Stockhausen*, 162–63.

³⁸"Ses doigts n'étaient pas en train pour le moment il a dit qu'il jouera quand même." Letter of 19 May 1856 from Stockhausen to Ferdinand Hiller. Ferdinand Hiller, *Aus Ferdinand Hillers Briefwechsel: Beiträge zu einer Biographie Ferdinand Hillers* (Cologne: Arno Volk-Verlag, 1968), 126.

Müllerin, a duet with another singer, and four other Lieder: Mendelssohn's "Schilffied," Hiller's "Das Wirthshaus am Rhein," and Schumann's "Mondnacht" and "Frühlingsnacht," a pairing he liked. Two days later, they performed a similar mixed program in the Saal der Leseegesellschaft in Bonn, offering a mix of piano and vocal items (again with an unnamed female singer), including nos. 15–17 of *Die schöne Müllerin* and the Schumann pairing.³⁹ Shortly afterwards on 30 May 1856, Stockhausen performed *Müllerin in toto* to a small audience in the Kleiner Saal of the Germanischer Hof in Cologne, accompanied by Hiller. However, on this occasion Hiller interpolated into the cycle the second, particularly Schubertian, movement of Beethoven's Piano Sonata, op. 90, as well as two freely improvised interludes. According to one reviewer, these interpolations were artistically effective and had the added benefit of giving Stockhausen a break during the concert.⁴⁰ Clara Schumann had improvised such connecting interludes for many years.⁴¹

In early 1859 Stockhausen met the cultivated, internationally successful, and superbly well-connected Joseph Joachim, who was in some ways the most impressive member of that circle of friends. Brahms had met Joachim six years earlier, and the two young men were undertaking an impressive project of self-improvement including counterpoint, literature, and philosophy. Stockhausen and Joachim immediately organized shared concerts, as a result of which Stockhausen performed *Die schöne Müllerin* for the blind, music-loving

King Georg V of Hanover, Joachim's patron and employer, on 17 April 1859.⁴²

Subsequent performances show a variety of approaches to the songs. For instance, a shared "Künstler-Concert" in the Leipzig Gewandhaus on 10 March 1859 used the standard model of arias plus songs; Stockhausen sang Mozart and Rossini, and Schubert's "Wohin," "Die liebe Farbe," and "Die böse Farbe," i.e., nos. 2, 16, and 17 from the cycle. In one mixed program in April 1860, which included Lieder by Schubert, Schumann, and Mendelssohn, Stockhausen accompanied himself in an encore of one of the *Müllerin* songs!⁴³ Alongside such concerts was a spate of performances of the whole cycle within Austro-German territory during the following decade, although it seems that other repertoire was inserted to ensure variety, and there may have also been improvisations. And even those performances would not necessarily be recognizable today once the detail is scrutinized; every concert billed as a complete performance included the declamation of Wilhelm Müller's unset poems, usually by an actress. In other words, it was the cycle of *poems*, rather than Schubert's songs, which constituted the whole in Stockhausen's day; and the usual practice of using an actress also ensured timbral variety. Echoing publishing practice, in which opus groups were regularly published in small volumes (*Hefte*), most printed programs also presented the songs in five volumes separated by lines or the word "Pause," suggesting that he took several breaks during the recital.

A widely reported complete performance on 10 May 1860 in the Musikverein in Vienna was accompanied by "Herr Dachs," evidently Josef Dachs, a piano professor at the Vienna Conservatory.⁴⁴ In this case, the unset poems were

³⁹Hofmann, *Johannes Brahms als Pianist und Dirigent*, 41.

⁴⁰"Hiller begleitete ihn am Piano, spielte dazwischen den E-dur-Satz aus Beethoven's Lychnowski-Sonate op. 90—eine sehr sinnige Wahl—und gewährte ausserdem dem Sänger Erholung, in dem er zwei Mal von einem Liede zum anderen in längerer freier Phantasie übergang, wobei er die eben gesungene Schubert'sche Melodie, und das zweite Mal daneben auch Anklänge an das Beethoven'sche Hauptmotiv mit Meisterschaft in compositorischer Gewandtheit und im Vortrage benutzte." "Tages- und Unterhaltungs-Blatt, Köln," *Niederrheinische Musik-Zeitung* 4/23 (7 June 1856): 184.

⁴¹See Valerie Woodring Goertzen, "Clara Wieck Schumann's Improvisations and Her 'Mosaics' of Small Forms," in *Beyond Notes: Improvisation in Western Music of the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Centuries*, ed. Rudolf Rasch (Turnhout: Brepols, 2011), 153–62.

⁴²Wirth, *Julius Stockhausen*, 192.

⁴³"Auf den rauschenden Beifall am Schluß noch eines der Müllerlieder von demselben Meister, wobei er sich selbst accompagnirte." *Deutsche Musik-Zeitung* 1/18 (28 April 1860): 143.

⁴⁴A-Wgm Programmsammlung, Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde, 10 May 1860. Extremely positive reviews appeared in the *Deutsche Musik-Zeitung* 1/20 (12 May 1860): 160; the *Monatsschrift für Theater und Musik* 6/20 (16 May 1860): 312, and again in the *Deutsche Musik-Zeitung* 1/21 (19 May 1860): 167. The latter is the lengthiest review, praising the concept and the sincerity of the artist to the skies.

declaimed by the celebrated Viennese actress Julie Rettich, a friend of the Schumanns.⁴⁵ Again, Stockhausen prepared the ground by giving two more typical programs earlier. Having been very positive about Stockhausen's earlier performance of the cycle, Hanslick was rather less excited this time around. He argued that attempting such an "experiment" too often was "hardly advisable" because it was simply wearisome, although he conceded that the room might simply have been unpleasantly warm, a reminder of how vulnerable artistic success is to seemingly trivial and irrelevant considerations. Hanslick was also less forgiving of Stockhausen's vocal frailties and annoyed by Dach's overcautious accompaniment. The novelty had worn off for him.⁴⁶ In a review of a complete *Müllerin* by Stockhausen on 25 March 1862 in Leipzig, Eduard Bernsdorf made a similar point when he commented that "only an artist like this can dare to attempt the experiment of singing twenty-three songs one after another" (the three extra numbers refer to the unset poems that were declaimed by a member of the Leipzig Stadttheater).⁴⁷

Nevertheless, more performances of the cycle followed, and Stockhausen's famous colleagues took note. Brahms wrote to Clara Schumann in spring 1861: "Now I'll just tell you very quietly that Stockhausen is repeating *Die schöne Müllerin* on Saturday [a real treat]. . . . On Tuesday we have a concert together, at which the whole of *Dichterliebe* will be sung by St.!!! . . . Stockhausen sings wonderfully; just imagine, on Saturday he will sing the complete *Müllerliebe* [*sic*] and on Tuesday the complete

Dichterliebe, and both very beautifully."⁴⁸ And Clara Schumann also mentioned in her diary: "Monday, 6 May, went to Johannes to congratulate him personally for the 7th [Brahms's birthday]. . . . Stockhausen was also here and gave a concert in which he sang the complete *Müllerlieder*."⁴⁹ Another performance on 24 March 1862 in the Leipzig Gewandhaus included a male actor, Otto Devrient, declaiming the unset poems.

On 15 October that year, Stockhausen took the cycle to the provinces, namely the Salle des Dominicains in the small town of Guebwiller in his native Alsace. The unset poems were declaimed, the cycle was divided into five parts as usual, and Clara Schumann participated as soloist (she may also have accompanied, but this is unspecified in the documentation). The involvement of such a venerated artist justified the interpolation of solo piano music into the program, much as Hiller had done a few years earlier. Clara Schumann therefore played Chopin's Ballade No. 1 in G Minor after No. 12 "Pause," and so yet another experience of the cycle was created (see plate 2). Indeed, the name "Pause" seems to have been a trigger for a break in which an instrumental number would be played.

A CYCLE FOR THE PEOPLE

Stockhausen's ambitions were now boundless. Together with Hiller, he organized a performance of the *Müllerin* on Tuesday 28 October 1862 in the vast Gürzenich Hall in Cologne, which seated 2000 people. Hiller accompanied, and the actress Pauline l'Arronge was the declamatrix. This was an unusual genre-cross-

⁴⁵Concert events in which famous actors and actresses declaimed poems, cycles of poems, and extracts from plays were held in comparable spaces to song recitals; as such, social circles and personnel regularly overlapped. See, for instance, a spoken program given by the actor Josef Lewinsky at the Bösendorfer-Saal on 3 and 5 April 1871, reproduced in Christina Meglitsch, *Wiens vergessene Konzertsäle: der Mythos der Säle Bösendorfer, Ehrbar und Streicher* (Frankfurt am Main/New York: P. Lang, 2005), 77.

⁴⁶Hanslick, *Geschichte des Concertwesens in Wien*, II, 213–15.

⁴⁷Bernsdorf was quoted in *Blätter für Musik, Theater und Kunst* 8/27 (1 April 1862): 108. He continued that even Stockhausen could not dispel the tedium that must necessarily arise from such a uniformity of sound and form.

⁴⁸"Jetzt erzähle ich ganz leise, daß Stockhausen am Sonnabend die schöne Müllerin wiederholt (ein wirklicher Genuß). . . . Am Dienstag haben wir zusammen Concert, da wird auch die ganze Dichterliebe von St. gesungen!!! . . . Stockhausen singt wunderschön und ich bitte Dich zu bedenken, daß er Sonnabend die Müllerliebe sämtlich und Dienstag die Dichterliebe vollständig und beides sehr schön singen wird." Letter from Brahms to Clara Schumann, [Hamburg] 25 April 1861. Berthold Litzmann, *Clara Schumann: Ein Künstlerleben: Nach Tagebüchern und Briefen*, 3 vols. (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1918–20), III, 101–02.

⁴⁹"Montag, den 6. Mai zu Johannes ihn zum 7. Persönlich zu begrüßen . . . auch war Stockhausen hier, gab Concert, in welchem er die Müllerlieder alle sang." Ibid., 102.

AVEC PERMISSION DE MONSIEUR LE MAIRE.

SALLE DES DOMINICAINS

Mercredi, le 15 Octobre 1862.

Die schöne Müllerin

Ein Lieder-Cyclus

Mis en musique par Franz SCHUBERT

Chanté par M. J. STOCKHAUSEN.

Le Prologue, l'Épilogue et les trois poésies non composées, seront déclamés par M. . .

PROLOGUE.

Première Série. — Das Wandern. — Behin? — Halt. — Dankagung an den Bach.

Deuxième Série. — Am Feierabend. — Der Reugierige. (Mühlenleben) — Ungebuld. Morgengruß. — Des Müllers Blumen.

Troisième Série. — Thränenregen. — Wein. — Pause.

Ballade (Sol mineur) par CHORIN
exécutée par Madame Schumann.

Quatrième Série — Mit dem grünen Lautenbande. — Der Jäger (Erster Schmerz, letzter Scherz). — Eifersucht und Stolz. — Die liebe Farbe. — Die böse Farbe.

Cinquième Série. — Trockne Blumen. (Blümlein vergiß mein.) — Der Müller und der Bach. — Des Baches Wiegenlied.

ÉPILOGUE.

On commencera à 8 heures du soir.

On peut se procurer des billets à l'Imprimerie de J. B. Jung
et le soir à la porte.

Prix du billet 2 francs.

Gachniller. — Typ. et Lith. de J. B. JUNG.

NATASHA
LOGES
*Die schöne
Müllerin*

ing event. It was billed as a “soirée,” a term normally reserved for concerts of small-scale chamber, solo, and vocal works, yet it took place in a venue normally associated with large orchestral and choral works, and it was marketed as a “Volkskonzert,” with extremely cheap tickets (see the program in plate 3).

Stockhausen’s mounting excitement as the tickets gradually sold out is palpable in his diary:

Müllerin rehearsal with Mademoiselle l’Arronge at Hiller’s.—Visit to Gürzenich at 3pm, 700 tickets sold. The director’s pulpit is removed. The effect is completely different. The mise-en-scène often counts for much of the success.—Feverish agitation at 4pm 900 tickets sold, at 5pm—1700 billets, at 7.30pm—2000. The excitement in the room. Everyone is coming and going, and has no idea where to wedge themselves in. . . . The sight of these 2000 people is intoxicating. . . . The Cologne public loves music above all, and first and foremost the national songs (the Lied!). . . . Profound effect of Schubert’s music. The text—wouldn’t it be better to have it printed and sold at the door? The effect would perhaps be more spontaneous. One attentive listener asked after the concert, “what does the hunter have to do with the story?” The musical phrase elongates the text, & the phrase itself becomes less intelligible.⁵⁰

The press noted the innovative and laudable aims of the concert. The *Niederrheinische Musik-Zeitung* confirmed that more than 2000 people had attended, that he had performed the complete cycle by Wilhelm Müller and Franz Schubert (note the shared billing of poet and composer) with only limited pauses, as demanded by the plot of this “monodrama.” Re-

calling Hanslick, a whiff of patriotic pride emanates from the words: “These noble folksongs, of such beauty as possessed by no other nation, have found in Stockhausen a singer who through the breath of tone gives them such life that poetry and music completely meld, and one no longer knows which deserves more admiration: the intimacy and integrity of the conception, or the wonderful artistry involved in expressing the concept through singing. It is impossible to convey the silent, rapt listening of the audience, and the eruption of enthusiasm after each song.”⁵¹

Thus singer, song, poetry, cycle, composer, audience, and nation are once more melded into a unified, transfigured whole. Nevertheless, the next day Stockhausen, exhausted and besieged with visitors, noted in his diary how little money he had made from the enterprise. One can only imagine the demands such a performance had made on his voice, which—as critics repeatedly noted—lacked operatic strength. He did not repeat it again.

Exactly a week later, in the small city of Barmen, he gave another *Müllerin* (4 November) that Clara Schumann definitely accompanied, as specially mentioned on the program. This was rather a different affair, with 475 attendees who each paid 1 Thaler. Again, Clara Schumann’s involvement resulted in yet another presentation of the cycle; she played Beethoven’s “Moonlight” Sonata in C♯ Minor, op. 27, no. 2, in the middle of the program (see program in plate 4).

Yet despite Clara Schumann’s fame and undoubted artistry, Stockhausen two days later expressed doubt about the practice of interpolating piano works into the cycle, writing: “Decidedly the millmaid is also a magician! . . . Neither Chopin’s nor Beethoven’s music have a good effect after No. 12 [“Pause”]. One would

⁵⁰“Répétition Müllerin avec Mlle l’Arronge chez Hiller.—Visite au Gürzenich à 3h 700 billets vendu. La chaire[?] du directeur enlevée. L’effet tout autre. La mise en scène est souvent pour beaucoup dans le succès. — Fièvre-agitation à 4h 900 billets vendu, à 7h10—1700 billets, à 7 1/2 - 2000. L’agitation dans la salle. Le monde se bouscule, vu et vient et ne sait plus où se caser. . . . La vue de ces 2000 personnes est enivrante. . . . Le public de Cologne aime par dessus tout la musique et avant tout les chants nationaux allemands (le Lied!). . . . Effet profond de la musique de Schubert. Le texte—ne vaut il pas mieux le faire imprimer & le vendre à la porte? Succès serait peut être plus spontané. Un auditeur attentif demandait après le concert ‘was will denn der Jäger in der Geschichte?’ La phrase musicale allonge le récit, & la période elle même devient moins intelligible.” Julius Stockhausen’s unpublished diary, D-Fmi Nachlass Julius Stockhausen, MF 20851.

⁵¹“Diese edeln Volkslieder, die keine andere Nation in solcher Schönheit besitzt, haben in Stockhausen einen Sänger gefunden, der ihnen durch den Hauch der Töne ein solches Leben gibt, dass Poesie und Musik vollständig in einander aufgehen, und man nicht weiss, ob man die Innigkeit und Wahrheit der Auffassung oder die wunderbare Kunst, dieser Auffassung durch den Gesang Ausdruck zu geben, mehr bewundern soll. Das stille, entzückte Lauschen der Zuhörerschaft und die nach jedem Liede ausbrechende Begeisterung zu schildern, ist unmöglich.” *Niederrheinische Musik-Zeitung* 10/44 (1 November 1862): 351.

S O I R É E ,

gegeben von

Herrn Julius Stockhausen

am

28. October 1862. *Cologne.*

PROGRAMM.

Die schöne Müllerin,

von

Wilhelm Müller.

Componirt von **Franz Schubert.**

- | | |
|---|--|
| 1) Prolog. | 3) Wohin? |
| Der Dichter (Declamation). | 4) Halt! |
| 2) Wanderschaft. | 5) Danksagung an den Bach. |
| (P a u s e) | |
| 6) Am Feierabend. | 9) Ungeduld. |
| 7) Der Neugierige. | 10) Morgengruss. |
| 8) Das Mühlenleben (Declamation). | 11) Des Müllers Blumen. |
| (P a u s e) | |
| 12) Thränenregen. | 14) Pause. |
| 13) Mein. | |
| (P a u s e) | |
| 15) Mit dem grünen Lautenbände. | 19) Die liebe Farbe. |
| 16) Der Jäger. | 20) Die böse Farbe. |
| 17) Eifersucht und Stolz. | 21) Blümlein Vergissmeinn (Declamation). |
| 18) Erster Schmerz, letzter Scherz (Declamation). | |
| (P a u s e) | |
| 22) Trockne Blumen. | 24) Des Baches Wiegenlied. |
| 23) Der Müller und der Bach. | |

Die Begleitung am Clavier hat Herr Capellmeister Hiller, die Declamation fräulein **Pauline L'Arronge** gefälligst übernommen.

Köln. M. DuMont-Schauberg.

1862. *4. November*
Barmen 143

PROGRAMM.

Die schöne Müllerin.
(Im Winter zu lesen.)

Der Dichter, als Prolog.

Wanderschaft. Wohin? Halt. Danksagung an den Bach.
Pause.
Am Feierabend. Der Neugierige. (Das Mühlenleben.)
Ungeduld. Morgengrün. Des Müllers Blumen.
Pause.
Thränenregen. Mein. *Pause.*

Intermezzo.

Cis-moll-Sonate von L. v. Beethoven,
vorgetragen von Frau **Clara Schumann.**

Mit dem grünen Lautenbände. Der Jäger. Eifersucht und
Stolz. (Erster Schmerz, letzter Scherz.) Die liebe Farbe.
Die böse Farbe.
Pause.
(Blümlein, Vergiss mein.) Trockne Blumen. Der Müller
und der Bach. Des Baches Wiegenlied.

Frau **CLARA SCHUMANN** hat die Begleitung der Lieder
gütigst übernommen.

Der Prolog und die nicht componirten Gedichte werden declamirt.

Druck von Friedrich Staats in Barmen.

Plate 4: No. 143 in D-Fmi Nachlass Julius Stockhausen, Konzert-Zettel.

prefer to insert nothing else into this admirable little drama!"⁵² He also noted that a male declaimer was preferable to a female one, although he gave no reason for this. It is possible that he himself was moving toward a purer conception of the cycle, shedding extraneous factors; alternatively, he may not have wanted to share the stage with another famous soloist, even one of whom he was personally very fond. It is not possible to tell which is the case, or whether both overlapped.

Stockhausen's next identified complete performance took place in Oldenburg with Albert Dietrich on 25 April 1863 (there is no extant program).⁵³ This performance has special poignancy, since the declamatrice on this occasion was the actress Ellen Franz, with whom Stockhausen was deeply and frantically in love. He had asked her to marry him six days before this concert, but both sets of parents opposed the match. She would eventually marry Duke Georg II of Meiningen ten years later, remained good friends with Brahms, and was one of his merriest correspondents.⁵⁴ A year later, Stockhausen married the music teacher Clara Toberenz from Berlin, of whom his parents also disapproved because she was not Catholic. The naturally devout Stockhausen suffered much moral turmoil in these months, but at the age of thirty-eight, followed his own mind, and the marriage seems to have been very happy.

Three days after this performance, on 28 April 1863, Stockhausen repeated the complete *Müllerin* in Hamburg. This program again broke the cycle into five volumes, but no other music was performed. The actress Marie Grösser declaimed, and Carl v. Holten accompanied be-

cause Brahms was not available.⁵⁵ Further performances followed that need not be discussed in more detail here—for example at the Berlin Musikakademie on 9 April 1864, about which the press reported that the public would gladly have encored *every* song.⁵⁶ A performance a month later on 6 May in Hamburg accompanied by Oscar Smith was billed as a "Cyclus von Liedern," seems to have included no additional music, and has no mention of intervals or breaks, but Charlotte Frohn declaimed the unset poems. The last complete performance of *Die schöne Müllerin* by Stockhausen in the 1860s took place that December in Brunswick, as reported in *Le guide musical*.⁵⁷

THE MÜLLERIN IN LONDON

After this, Stockhausen seems to have concentrated on other works, his demanding post as director of the Hamburg Philharmonie and Singakademie, and his rapidly growing family. Perhaps as a result, his concerts in 1868 reverted to the usual format of mixed shared programs, including just a small number of songs from *Müllerin*.⁵⁸ The next complete performance I have identified took place considerably later in London. Again, he laid the ground for this event by first offering a more usual mixed program with several other musicians on 18 May 1871. This was a private concert at

⁵²"Décidément aussi la Müllerin est une magicienne! . . . Ni la musique de Chopin ni la musique de Beethoven ne font un heureux effet après le No. 12. Il veut mieux n'intercaler aucun morceau dans cet admirable petit drame!" D-Fmi Nachlass Julius Stockhausen, MF 20851.

⁵³See *Johannes Brahms im Briefwechsel mit Julius Stockhausen*, 34. Letter from Stockhausen to Brahms, 17 April 1863: "Am 28 singe ich die Müllerlieder. Soll ich v. Holten bitten, od. bist du wieder da? Am 25t. sing' ich sie in Oldenburg mit Dietrich & als Declamatrice, Frl. Franz aus Berlin, eine allerliebste, gebildete junge Dame, die aus Begeisterung für die Kunst Schauspielerin geworden ist."

⁵⁴See their correspondence in *Johannes Brahms Briefwechsel* vol. 17: *Johannes Brahms im Briefwechsel mit Herzog Georg II. von Sachsen-Meiningen und Helene Freifrau von Heldburg* (Tutzing: Hans Schneider, 1991).

⁵⁵See No. 178 in D-Fmi Nachlass Julius Stockhausen, Konzert-Zettel. *Neue Berliner Musikzeitung* 7/19, 6 May 1863.

⁵⁶No extant program. Reported in *Le guide musical* 10/16 (14 April 1864): 64.

⁵⁷No extant program. Reported in *Le guide musical* 10/49 (1 December 1864): 196.

⁵⁸See for example a concert on 24 November 1868 in Munich, described as a soirée, in which chamber/piano and vocal works alternated. Item 2 was a Boieldieu aria; Item 4 was "Am Feierabend," "Der Neugierige," "Die boese [sic] Farbe," from *Müllerin*; and the closing item 6 was Schumann's "Widmung," "Nussbaum," "Mondnacht," "Frühlingsnacht." Hans von Bülow accompanied. Program 347 in D-Fmi Nachlass Julius Stockhausen, Konzert-Zettel. On 2 December, in the Munich Odeon (part of the music school), he again sang within a mixed program of Boieldieu, Handel, and "Wohin," "Der Neugierige," and "Mein" from *Müllerin*. *Johannes Brahms im Briefwechsel mit Julius Stockhausen*, 58. As a final example, on 8 February 1869 in Karlsruhe, he sang a foyer concert for the Quartettverein, which included Schumann's "Harfner" Ballade and three unspecified songs from *Müllerin*. *Ibid.*, 67.

14 Hyde Park Gate presenting the typical alternation of vocal and instrumental items. Stockhausen sang numbers by Donizetti, Schumann's "Fluthenreicher Ebro" and "Widmung" (to end part 1); a Mozart duet; and Anna Regan sang Schumann's "Mondnacht" and Schubert's "Wohin" as the penultimate item (see program in plate 5).⁵⁹

Stockhausen reserved the complete *Müllerin* for his farewell concert of the season on 5 July in London. This event was widely reported in both the British and German press.⁶⁰ In the reviews, the underpinning ideology was lauded in a way that is familiar today. Thus, one reviewer wrote:

When an artist of Herr Stockhausen's classical leanings gives a concert it is natural to expect that he will aim at higher things than the presentation of odds and ends, chosen more for the sake of the artists than for their own worth or the public edification. Few, however, could have anticipated the absolute novelty offered to the audience. . . . He put forward the cycle of songs written by Schubert and known in England as "The Fair Maid of the Mill" (Die Schöne Müllerin). Various numbers of the series are familiar to our concert-rooms; but it is safe to declare that never till Wednesday evening have the whole been given in order. Herein lay the novelty, and to every amateur, the attraction of Herr Stockhausen's concert.⁶¹

Similarly, the *Illustrated Times* noted that the cycle was a "very novel feature," which attracted an appreciative though not a crowded audience.⁶² The *Pall Mall Gazette* praised Stockhausen's innovation as "novel, interesting, and, above all, artistic in character," but with reservations because of the public's limitations: "the plan of Herr Stockhausen's concert was much to be commended, though we cannot hope that it will be generally followed. The great majority of our concerts, even when

they are given with the professed view of elevating the public taste, are full of the queerest contrasts."⁶³ Thus the critic interprets both the sparseness of the audience, and the rarity of such events as an indictment of both artists and the public for their lack of interest in "higher things."

This is all to be expected, but it is only from the *Daily Telegraph & Courier* review that certain important details emerge. Not only were the unset poems declaimed by Clara Stockhausen (it is unclear whether in English translation or in German), but the songs were actually split between three singers—i.e., the cycle was performed complete, but not by Stockhausen alone. This paper reported the following:

Herr Stockhausen was laudably careful to make his entertainment a complete thing in its way. Thus the numbers of the Liederkreis which Schubert did not set to music were read in their proper place by Mdme Stockhausen; while associated with the concert-giver, who himself sang eleven of the twenty songs, were Mdme. Loewe and Mr. Arthur Byron, no less excellent a pianist than Miss Agnes Zimmermann discharging the onerous and, in this case, most responsible duty of accompanist.⁶⁴

Yet again, the underlying principle of variety underpinned the presentation of the work; there was no question of twenty songs being presented through the sound of just one voice. Unfortunately, it is not possible to establish which songs were allocated to each singer (or indeed, in which language they were sung) and therefore whether to discern a pattern in the disposition. Still, the performance came across as a "complete thing."

The mid-1850s to the mid-1860s were evidently crucial years in the history of *Die schöne Müllerin*, and one might speculate on how different its fate might have been without Stockhausen's championing. In comparison, there was (and is) an almost complete lack of interest in performing most other Schubert songs in their published opus groups. And yet, this exploration of concert history has shown

⁵⁹Accompanied by W. G. Cusins.

⁶⁰"Am 5. Juli gab Stockhausen den ganzen Cyclus der Schubert'schen Müllerlieder zum Besten und würde dabei durch seine talentvolle Schülerin Frl. Löwe und den Tenoristen Byron unterstützt." *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung* 6/29 (19 July 1871): 462. Most London papers advertised the concert.

⁶¹*Daily Telegraph & Courier*, 7 July 1871, 3.

⁶²*Illustrated Times*, 8 July 1871, 14.

⁶³*Pall Mall Gazette*, 12 July 1871, 12.

⁶⁴*Daily Telegraph & Courier*, 7 July 1871, 3.

14, HYDE PARK GATE.

THURSDAY, 18th MAY, 1871.

PROGRAMME.

PART I.

SONATA—E flat	<i>Beethoven.</i>
Madlle. BRANDES and Herr L. STRAUS.	
ARIA, " <i>Pur dicesti</i> "	<i>Lotti.</i>
Madlle. REGAN.	
RONDO CAPRICCIOSO	<i>Mendelssohn.</i>
Madlle. BRANDES.	
RECIT. ED ARIA, " <i>Torquato Tasso</i> "	<i>Donizetti.</i>
Herr STOCKHAUSEN.	
NOCTURNE	<i>Ernst.</i>
Herr L. STRAUS.	
ARIA, " <i>La Promessa</i> "	<i>Rossini.</i>
Madlle. REGAN.	
CAPRICE	<i>A. Schmitt.</i>
Madlle. BRANDES.	
LIEDER { A. " <i>Fluthenreicher Ebro</i> " } { B. " <i>Widmung</i> " }	<i>R. Schumann.</i>
Herr STOCKHAUSEN.	

PART II.

DUO, " <i>Crudel Perchè</i> "	<i>Mozart.</i>
Madlle. REGAN and Herr STOCKHAUSEN.	
PRESTO	<i>Scarlatti.</i>
ARABESQUE	<i>R. Schumann.</i>
RONDO—MOTO CONTINUO Madlle. BRANDES.	<i>Weber.</i>
CHANSON DE MAI	<i>Meyerbeer.</i>
Madlle. REGAN.	
LIEDER { A. " <i>Der Nussbaum</i> " } { B. " <i>Frühlingsnacht</i> " }	<i>R. Schumann.</i>
Herr STOCKHAUSEN.	
ADAGIO and RONDO	<i>Vienztempo.</i>
Herr L. STRAUS.	
LIEDER { A. " <i>Mondnacht</i> " } { B. " <i>Wohin</i> " }	<i>R. Schumann.</i>
Madlle. REGAN.	<i>Schubert.</i>
LIEDER OHNE WORTE Madlle. BRANDES.	<i>Mendelssohn.</i>

At the Pianoforte MR. W. G. CUSINS.

NATASHA
LOGES
*Die schöne
Müllerin*

how the description “complete performance of a cycle” embraces many different presentations and has offered a glimpse into their wider implications. In that decade of experimentation, much was learned; for example, Stockhausen’s mammoth performance at the Gürzenich in 1862 was not repeated and did not ever establish itself as a norm, possibly because, notwithstanding its critical success, it violated a deeply embedded understanding of what the Lied was and where it belonged. The aesthetic identities of the artists were constantly shaped by practical compromises; miscellaneous programs were frequently offered by artists like Stockhausen and Clara Schumann despite the association of these artists with the coherent, planned programming that established itself firmly during the twentieth century. Also, rather than having to refer to the cycle as a whole, reviewers like Hanslick felt able to evaluate single *Müllerin* songs, referring freely to weaker and stronger numbers because the overwhelmingly dominant experience of the work was still of individual numbers or small groups of songs. The interest and approval of audiences evidently relied on multiple factors, including such seemingly trivial considerations as the weather. However, the risk that complete performances might be overlong and lacking in variety was mitigated by the practice of applauding between songs, breaking up the cycle into smaller sets, the inclusion of the declaimed poems, and the interpolation of other works on occasions where

a famous pianist was involved. These practices afforded many moments for the audience to relax their concentrated listening and resettlement themselves. This account of early performances of *Die schöne Müllerin* shows how the notions of miscellany and coherence overlapped, and how established and emerging concert ideologies could coexist within a single concert.



Abstract.

Franz Schubert’s song cycle *Die schöne Müllerin* makes enormous demands not only on the performers but also on its audience, a factor that shaped the early performance history of the work. In this article, the pioneering complete performances of *Die schöne Müllerin* by the baritone Julius Stockhausen (1826–1906) will be explored, as well as the responses of his audiences, collaborators, and critics. The circumstances surrounding the first complete performance in Vienna’s Musikverein on 4 May 1856, more than three decades after the cycle was composed in 1823, will be traced. A survey of subsequent performances reveal two things: within Stockhausen’s concert career at least, it was no foregone conclusion that the complete cycle should always be performed; and a performance of the “complete cycle” meant many different things in his day. Stockhausen’s artistic idealism jostled against the practical forces that necessarily influenced his approach to recital programming, leading to a multifaceted, untidy performance history for this cycle.

Keywords: Stockhausen, Clara Schumann, Schubert, *Müllerin*, performance, song cycle